

**THE APARTHEID SEPARATION WALL AND  
A VIABLE PALESTINIAN STATE**

By

**Reema Khalil Abu Hilal**

Supervisor

**Dr. Mahmoud Ali**

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement of the Master's Degree of Arts in  
Diplomatic Studies

**Faculty of Graduate Studies**

**University of Jordan**

February 2008

This Thesis "The Apartheid Separation Wall and a Viable Palestinian State" was successfully defended and approved on Thursday, November 15<sup>th</sup>, 2007.

**Examination Committee**

**Signature**

**Dr. Mahmoud A. Ali**

.....

Associate Prof. Political Sciences department.  
Applied Science University

**Dr. Omar H. Hadrami**

.....

Assistant Prof. International Studies Dept.  
University of Jordan

**Dr. Hasan M. Al-Momani**

.....

Assistant Prof. International Studies Dept.  
University of Jordan

**Prof. Abdelfattah A. Al-Rashdan**

.....

Prof. Political Sciences Dept.  
Muata University

## **Dedication**

There are a number of people whom I am greatly indebted to;

My mother, who has been a source of encouragement and inspiration to me, of continuous learning, growing, and developing throughout my life who represented to me a women's ability to redefine and recreate the best lives.

A very special thank for your practical and emotional support as I added the roles of women and mothers, to the competing demands of business, work, study and personal development, to my Dear sons Bader and Karam, for being a great source of motivation and inspiration even when being along time 'without Mum' was hard. This work is for and because of you and all the generations to come.

I offer special thanks to those who supported me of producing this thesis.

## Acknowledgement

Writing a thesis involves certainly a very hard work, it does matter the path you opt for, the story behind it, the people you meet, you work with, their support and commitment.

Many people have walked along with me and have helped me to choose the right direction during the last years. Those words of my thesis are acknowledgement to them.

I would like to gratefully acknowledge the enthusiastic supervision of Dr. Mahmoud Ali, during this work your sound advice and careful guidance were invaluable. I have really appreciated your support and encouragement. Furthermore I would like to thank all the committee members for their review and valuable comments. I appreciated all the professors of the faculty of Graduate Studies, Diplomatic Studies Department, at the University of Jordan, to all their valuable efforts which have enriched my knowledge.

I would most specifically like to thank Mr. Ayman Hijjawi, I have been privileged to have you as my boss, who has provided me with support emotionally and financially throughout this long journey, all the way since the beginning of my studies, to improve my career. Thank you Mr. Hijjawi for believing in me as you always believes in the richness of learning.

Thanks for the unconditional support given to me by Mr. Naser Aloul, you have been the person most involved in my task and you have contributed essentially to the existence of this thesis. Thank you for helping me whenever I needed it.

Sincerely, I am grateful to thank all my family members, friends and colleagues for their encouragement and support to accomplish my task.

## List of Contents

	Page
<b>Committee Decision</b> .....	ii
<b>Dedication</b> .....	iii
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	iv
<b>List of Contents</b> .....	v
<b>Abstract</b> .....	vii
<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
Literature Review.....	3
The Study Objectives.....	6
Methodology of the Study .....	6
Structure of the Study .....	7
<b>Chapter One: The Arab-Israeli Conflict</b>	
1.1 Introduction .....	9
1.2 The History of the Conflict.....	10
1.3 Opens Doors to Searching for Peace in the Middle East.....	44
1.4 Suicide Bombings.....	53
1.5 Al Aqsa Second Intifada 2000 .....	54
1.6 The Road Map to Permanent Two- State Solution.....	61
1.7 The Signing of the Agreement between Jordan & Israel.....	66
1.8 Syria and Israel Negotiations .....	66
1.9 Lebanon and Israeli Conflict .....	68
1.10 Arab Peace Initiative 2002.....	69
1.11 The Efforts by the International Community to Activate the Israeli Palestinian Peace Process..	70
<b>Chapter Two: The Separation Wall</b>	
2.1 Introduction .....	74
2.2 The Wall Definition.....	74
2.3 The Implied Purposes of Constructing the Wall.....	83
2.4 The Separation Wall Components.....	85
2.5 The Genesis Alignment of the Wall.....	87
2.6 The Cost of the Wall .....	92
2.7 The Depth of the Wall .....	92
2.8 The Path of the Wall .....	93
2.9 The Separation Wall Stages.....	96
2.10 Palestinian Enclaves of the Wall.....	109
2.12 The Implications of the Separation Wall.....	113
<b>Chapter Three: The International Community Attitude Towards the Separation Wall</b>	
3.1 Introduction .....	140
3.2 The International Solidarity Movement.....	142
3.2.1 UN and The Separation Wall.....	142
3.2.2 The International Court of Justice and the Separation Wall.....	143
3.2.3 The United States Attitude towards the Separation Wall.....	152
3.2.4 The European Union and The Separation Wall.....	156
3.2.5 Jordan's Official Position Regarding the Separation Wall.....	163

**Chapter Four: The Palestinian State**

4.1	Introduction.....	168
4.2	The Viable State .....	172
4.3	Israel Needs Viable Palestinian State.....	176
4.4	The USA Vision for The Viable State of Palestine.....	177
4.5	Ways to Make the Independent Palestinian State Successful.....	180
4.6	Reframing the Conflict.....	202
	4.6.1 Does Jordan represent Alternative Home? .....	204
	4.6.2 Does Egypt Considered as the other alternative? .....	205
4.7	The Reality on the Ground.....	207

**Chapter Five: Conclusions**

5.1	Conclusions.....	210
-----	------------------	-----

<b>References</b> .....	216
-------------------------	-----

**Appendices**

Appendix A	A letter sent to The Secretary General of United Nations from The Grassroots Palestinian Anti-Apartheid Wall Campaign.....	232
	Map for The Separation Wall in the West Bank .....	234

<b>Abstract in Arabic</b> .....	235
---------------------------------	-----

# **THE APARTHEID SEPARATION WALL AND A VIABLE PALESTINIAN STATE**

**By**

**Reema Khalil Abu Hilal**

**Supervisor**

**Dr. Mahmoud Ali**

## **ABSTRACT**

This study attempts to prove that by constructing a permanent separation wall, Israel will annex the majority of the West Bank to leave only small portion of the West Bank land to the Palestinians. On the other hand, the study evaluates the long run effect of the construction of the wall on the Israeli security issue and the possibility of implementing a viable Palestinian State. The facts on the ground lay bare that the wall is not protecting Israeli citizens inside Israel; it is instead protecting Israel's occupation, illegal colonies and ongoing colonization of Palestinian land. For this purpose, the following questions come to mind: What are the implied purposes of constructing the separation Wall? If the Wall constructed for the security reasons, what is the justifications behind separating Palestinian Communities? How will this Wall ensure and guarantee the security of The Jewish State? What are the political alternatives if the Palestinian State does not establish? In addition to that, the study emphasizes that the wall is being built in a way that is based on political and demographic considerations rather than Security intentions.

To answer these questions, the study introduces discussion in the thesis's chapters reviewing theories of the process of state building within the current situation. Therefore the study concludes that the prospects for establishing an independent Palestinian state are uncertain. In addition to that, the study finds that the separation wall has a negative effect on the Palestinians, the Palestinian State and on the peace process. On the other hand, the Wall doesn't bring any security or stability to Israel as much as it forms pressure on the Palestinian people. That the Wall threatens the concept of a Palestinian Viable State, as well as the region's security interests, thus, it will practical and irreversibly terminate any chance for the establishment of a viable, sustainable Palestinian State.

## Introduction

The Arab-Israeli conflict is a long-running conflict in the Middle East connected with the migration of Jews to the Historical Palestinian Land, the Palestinian self-determination on their occupied land and, the Israeli's relations with the Arab states and the Palestinian population. The dispute between the Israelis and the Palestinians is one of the most enduring of all the world's conflicts. It has its roots in the historic claim to the land which lies between the Eastern shores of the Mediterranean Sea and the Jordan River. For the Palestinians the last 100 years have brought colonization, expulsion and military occupation, followed by a difficult search for self-determination, and for coexistence with the nation they hold responsible for their suffering. While, for the Jewish people of Israel, it means the return to the Promised Land of their forefathers after centuries of persecution around the world was the main target.

In 2002 Israel began constructing a huge Separation Wall in and around the occupied West Bank claiming that the Wall is the only way to defend itself against suicide bombings by Palestinian militants which shook the country in the early years of Al Aqsa Second Intifada, which erupted in 2000. A major issue of the 2003 Israel election campaign had been the erection of a security wall advocated by the Israeli Labor party. The Israeli right, including Ariel Sharon's Likud party, opposed the idea, because it would create a de-facto border that prevent the establishment of a Jewish State in Eretz-Israel [*The term Eretz Israel can refer to a geographical area, which, according to the Torah, includes Jordan, present-day Lebanon, most of present-day Syria and part of present-day Egypt (northern Sinai), and Iraq*], <sup>1</sup> as well as dividing Jerusalem, and putting most of the Israeli settlements in the West Bank outside the protection of the security arrangements.

---

<sup>1</sup> Rainey, Anson., Aharoni, Yohanan., and Ze'ev, Safrai., (1993), **The Macmillan Bible Atlas**. Third Edition. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, p.15.



During 2003, Prime Minister Ariel Sharon adopted the barrier concept, changing the route to include major Israeli settlements as well as including a projected eastern portion that would envelope the Palestinians in two enclaves. As the wall went up, it became evident that it would trap many Palestinians who would be cut off from their fields and places of work.

In July 2004, the International Court of Justice at Hague declared an advisory opinion that the wall was illegal and construction should be immediately halted. Israel rejected advisory opinion that it would not abide by what was an advisory ruling by the ICJ, and the construction of the wall continued despite increasing protests and growing international criticism.

The Separation Wall, "Security Wall" in official Israeli language is in fact an Apartheid Wall. Israel maintains that the Wall is a temporary structure to physically separate the West Bank from Israel, and thus to prevent suicide attacks on Israeli citizens. However the wall's location, suggest that it is more realistically an additional effort to confiscate Palestinian land, facilitate further colony expansion and unilaterally redraw geopolitical borders all the while encouraging an exodus of Palestinians by denying them the ability to earn a living from their land, reach their schools or work places, access adequate water resources, or reach essential health care. Palestinians, who are meant to live under this Apartheid system. Simply, the separation wall will deny the Palestinians their fundamental rights to establish a free, viable, and sovereign state, and will cause violence and suffering, perhaps for decades.

## Literature Review:

There are some previous studies that are related to this subject, it necessary to display summaries for what previous studies contained that they will be major for this thesis:

1- "The origin of the Palestine-Israel conflict". Study published by Jews for Justice in the Middle East, in 2000. It includes the basic concepts that must be understood to continue the discussion of this conflict, by reviewing a number of key approaches and plans delineating the activities of Israeli governments in the West Bank, and discuss the principal institutions and processes involved in the establishment of a settlement, in addition by presenting a typology of settlement according to various forms of settlement.

2- *The New Intifada: Resisting Israel's Apartheid Book*, Edited by Roane in 2001, Introduction by Noam Chomsky, London: Verso 2001. The book provides a detailed description and examination of the power dynamics characterizing the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. This is a timely story of the Al-Aqsa Intifada, the second Palestinian uprising in September 2000. Edited by Nation Copy Chief Carey, the book tells a compelling story of repression and resistance and of the triumphs and tragedies of ordinary Palestinians with extraordinary resolve to bring dignity to their daily lives. Contributors to this volume include distinguished activist academics, such as Edward Said and Noam Chomsky, as well as a number of other writers with a long history of academic, journalistic, or activist involvement in Middle Eastern affairs, such as Robert Fisk, Sara Roy, and Azmi Bishara. The book uncover the social, political, and economic processes that led to the eruption of the second intifada, corroborating Brazilian educator Paulo Freire's famous claim that "never in history has violence been initiated by the oppressed." Violence, the book attempts to show, the most insidious current manifestations is the Israeli occupation of Palestinian territories.

Edward Said critiques "apartheid" which he claims is what Israel enforces in the Palestinian territories. Consider the economy. In one essay, Harvard professor Sara Roy points out that within the first three years following the 1993 Oslo peace agreement. Mouin Rabbani, director of the Palestinian American Research Center in the West Bank, points out in his own essay that the Jewish population living in the territories has increased from about 110,000 in 1993 to 195,000 in 2000. The uniqueness of *The New Intifada* is the way it intertwines scholarly essays with personal stories that provide a face and soul to the occupation's harsh reality. In "The Implementation of the Right of Return," Salman Abu Sitta, attempts to make a demographic argument. The book provides a platform for voices that are usually marginalized in the West.

3- The Apartheid Wall fact sheet, Israel's Unilateral Separation, produced by Palestinian Negotiating Team, in 2003, focus on the Wall's location, and the damage caused by the destruction of land and property of the Wall's Construction. That the study denied that the wall was a political border, but the fact on the ground shows that the Separation Wall is not merely an attempt to expand the borders of Israeli sovereignty by snatching land from the West Bank. It is also an attempt to constrain the sovereignty of a future Palestinian State.

4- "The Impact of Israel's Separation Barrier on Affected West Bank Communities", by the Local Aid Coordination Committee (LACC) in May 2003 commissioned the study, which was carried under the direction of a Steering Group composed of members of the donor Humanitarian and Emergency Policy Group (HEPG), the European Commission, the Government of Norway, the US Government, UNSCO, and the World Bank), plus the International Monetary Fund,. This report about the Wall out of concern at the impact it could have on Palestinian livelihoods and the viability of local economies, as well as on humanitarian assistance and donor development projects.

5- The Israeli Racist Separation Wall, studies prepared by the International Press Center, in October 2003 and February 2004, informed that the Wall is a wall for settlement expansion in the Palestinian Lands and its main goal is to undermine the peace process and the Road Map as well as to prevent the creation of a Palestinian State.

6- "Building a Successful Palestinian State", Published by the RAND Corporation, in 2005. This study conducted by the RAND Palestinian State Study Team, they focused on a single analytical question; how can independent Palestinian State be made successful? By developing recommendations, based on rigorous analysis, about steps that Palestinians, Israel, The United States, and International Community could take if a state was established to promote the State's success. The study published in 2005.

7- Under the Guise of Security, a recent report submitted by; BIMKOM(Planners for Planning Rights) and B" TSELEM(The Israeli Information Center for Human Rights in the Occupied Territories), in December 2005, The goal of this report is to shed light on questions related to the connection between the settlements and the separation barrier's route, points out the significant inconsistencies between the security considerations Israel purportedly relied on in setting the route, and the reasons relating to expansion of the settlements.

While it may appear to have some of the attributes of a separation plan, indeed the wall is positioned in order to prevent the separation of the two states, and to ensure continued Israeli control over future Israeli territory. Thus the wall represents the strategic embodiment of expansionist policies for the Israeli government.

## **The Study Objective**

This study aims at providing practical evidences to prove that by constructing the separation wall, Israel will annex the majority of the West Bank to leave only small portion of land to the Palestinians. On the other hand, the study evaluates the long term effects of the construction of the wall on the Israeli security issue and the possibility of establishing a viable Palestinian State.

In order to understand the objectives of the study by searching for the reasonable answers to **the following questions**:

What are the implied purposes of constructing the claimed "Security fence" Apartheid Wall? If the Wall is constructed for the security reasons, what are the justifications behind separating Palestinian Communities? How will this Wall ensure and guarantee the security of Jewish State? What are the political alternatives if the Palestinian State was not established?

## **Methodology of the study**

This study is using a historical and descriptive approach depending on different reliable English and Arabic sources of information by which one can investigate security, political, economic as well as social impact of the construction of the separation wall on the lives of Palestinians in West Bank. Thus the study contributes to the related literature by investigating both the issue of building the separation wall and the availability of establishing a Palestinian State at the same time. This will provide a basic understanding as to emphasize that the wall, as well as the occupation itself is considered a manifest violation of international law, indeed, the actual effect of this separation wall is to prevent the possibility of an independent and sovereign Palestinian state in the West Bank and Gaza.

## **Structure of Study**

In addition to the introductory remarks, this study is organized to be comprised of five chapters.

### **Chapter One: The Arab-Israeli Conflict**

This chapter aims to provide a historical background to the wider Arab-Israeli conflict, with emphasis on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, and focuses on searching for peace in the Middle East as well as the efforts by the International Community to activate the Israeli Palestinian Peace Process.

### **Chapter Two: The Wall Separation**

This chapter provides the background necessary for understanding the wall definition, the implied purposes of constructing the Wall, the Separation Wall Components, the Genesis Alignment of the Wall, the cost of the Wall Construction, as well as, the Implications of the Separation Wall on the Palestinian Regional Contiguity.

### **Chapter Three: The International Community Attitude towards the Separation Wall**

This chapter gives an over view for the International Community position in regards to the Wall Separation, such as, UN, International Court, The United States, the European Union, and Jordan specifically.

### **Chapter Four: The Palestinian State**

This chapter discusses the main points regarding the Palestinian states whereas, understanding the meaning of viability, the USA Vision for the Middle East, and reviewing the ways to create a successful Palestinian state.

### **Chapter Five: Conclusion**

This chapter summarizes the study and presents the conclusions in regards to the Arab-Israeli conflict and the Separation Wall.

**Chapter**

**(1)**

**The Arab-Israeli Conflict**

6 - The report failed to mention in any way, Israeli plans to isolate the Jordan Valley via the eastern Wall. While Israeli modifications did not discuss the Jordan Valley (for obvious reasons) the significance of the Wall within Israeli strategy for this region ought to merit great concern in the UN.

7 - Nor did the report display any understanding of the way in which Israel's perpetual expansion in the West Bank is made possible by the de-facto impasse. The potent signs of Israeli Occupation such as settler-only roads, industrial and security zones need to be seen within the context of an Apartheid system imposed from above on the Palestinian people. The Wall forms an intrinsic part of the Israeli "colonial project", drawn up in the so-called "disengagement plan".

That these so-called "modifications" form the major impetus of the UN report ignores the wider implications of the Wall and its fundamental ramifications for Palestinian life and existence. The refusal of the Secretary-General of the UN to visit the Wall is further evidence that the UN is failing to support the legitimate right of the Palestinians to self-determination. By turning the significant decisions made at the ICJ into humanitarian issues, the UN shuns its responsibilities within its mandate, over human rights and freedom.

We are deeply concerned that the position of the UN appears to have become entwined with the interests of the Occupiers and their supporters in the United States.

We demand that the UN abide by international law and work towards the destruction of the Wall and the ending of the illegal Occupation, as it has been mandated to do. This is a crucial time for the UN to show whether it will begin to implement the countless resolutions passed in support of the Palestinian struggle, or whether it will provide meek and hopeless gestures in the form of "humanitarian" assistance.

Yours Faithfully

The National Committee to Resist the Apartheid Wall





## الملخص

The Palestinian Foreign Ministry slammed the new road as "emphasizing Israel's approach aiming to undermine prospects for geographical and demographic contiguity of the West Bank." The Times of Israel quoted PA Transportation Ministry Spokesman Mohammad Hamdan as saying that "all roads in the State of Palestine should be accessible to Palestinians." In addition to Route 4370's wall, the Separation Barrier, also dubbed the apartheid wall, snakes 708 kilometers around the West Bank, encroaching as much as 18 kilometers inside Palestinian territory, and in parts, blocks Palestinians from accessing their fields and visiting friends and family. Israel builds a wall and no one bats an eyelid, Trump wants to build a wall and everyone is losing their mind. "The 'separation wall' is being built at a frantic pace. It does not separate Israel and the Palestinians. It separates the Palestinian villages and their lands." Despite Blair's promise, intended to drum up support for the attack on Iraq, of a "viable Palestinian state", the British government has remained silent about the apartheid Wall which is now carving up the land designated for a future Palestinian state. Dismantling the Wall, along with the Israeli settler colonies, must be demanded by the whole international community. Gush Shalom. The Apartheid. Wall. Palestine Solidarity Campaign fact sheet. Israel opened a new road in the central occupied West Bank on Thursday with an eight-meter wall separating Palestinian and Israeli traffic, leading many to deem the route "Apartheid Road." While Israeli media have reported that Palestinians with Jerusalem IDs or Israeli citizenship would be allowed to use the Israeli-side of the road to travel from Jerusalem to the West Bank, heightened security and a new checkpoint along the road have led to speculation that Palestinians, no matter what ID they carry, will be subject to discrimination by Israeli border police who man the checkpoint. The "Apartheid Road" has been years in the making, and according to rights groups, and is about much more than just easing traffic for settlers traveling to Jerusalem. Apartheid ("apartness" in the language of Afrikaans) was a system of legislation that upheld segregationist policies against non-white citizens of South Africa. After the National Party gained power in South Africa in 1948, its all-white government immediately began enforcing existing policies of racial segregation. Under apartheid, nonwhite South Africans (a majority of the population) would be forced to live in separate areas from whites and use separate public facilities. Contact between the two groups would be limited. Despite strong and consistent opposition to apartheid within and outside, By limiting the territorial contiguity and economic viability of the oPt, Israeli settlements pose the single greatest threat to the establishment of an independent Palestinian state, and hence, to a just and lasting peace between Israelis and Palestinians. Source :PLO/NAD. Apartheid Wall as a Network and the Repression of Popular Resistance. The Apartheid Wall's Location and Costs. The Apartheid Wall's Location and Costs. International Community Role. International Community Role.