THE THIRTY YEAR PROBLEM:
THE POLITICS OF AUSTRALIAN TAX REFORM

Richard Eccleston
Acknowledgments

In writing this book I have accumulated a number of debts. Firstly I would like to thank my colleagues in the Department of Politics and Public Policy at Griffith University. In particular I would like to thank Professor Pat Weller for his support of this project, including the resources he has devoted to it under the auspices of Griffith University’s Centre for Governance and Public Policy.

I would like to thank those who have had a direct input into the project including Tom Conley, Steffen Ganghof, Alex Gash, and Lindsay Rae. Special thanks go to Stephen Bell because without his expert guidance this book would never have been written. Thanks go to Neil Warren and the Board and staff of the Australian Tax Research Foundation for both their interest in this project and for publishing this book. Any remaining errors are my responsibility.

Finally I would like to thank Claire McKenny for her love and support and Bess, our spoilt border collie, for her constant companionship.

I would like to dedicate this book to Eileen Groom for her love and support during my formative years.

RE JUNE 2004
CONTENTS

Introduction 6
   The problematic politics of tax reform 7
   The scope of the book 8
   Explaining Australian taxation policy 10
   The structure of the study 11
1 Explaining the politics of tax reform 14
   Tax reform and state capacity 16
   The institutional dynamics of tax reform 17
   Relational dynamics and institutional change 18
   Economic forces, ideas and tax reform 21
   Public opinion, leadership and successful tax reform 23
   Towards a conceptual model 24
2 Funding a new nation: The historical basis of Australian Tax Policy 26
   The federal compromise and its implications for Australian taxation policy 27
   The federal settlement: ‘New protectionism’ and the two-party system 30
   Taxation in hard times: State capacity and tax reform 1910 to 1950 32
   The context of Australian taxation policy at the end of the post-war boom 40
   Conclusion 50
   The origins of the new taxation reform agenda 53
   Policy without politics: The Asprey Committee of Inquiry 57
   The reactive state: inflation and tax reform 1974–1976 63
   Electoral pressure and the pork barrel: reform failure and the Fraser Government 68
   Conclusion 71
   Revisiting reform: the political and economic context 73
   The limits of consensus politics 77
   The stakeholders 79
   The Draft White Paper 82
   The National Tax Summit: A test of state capacity 89
   The aftermath: Political learning and partisan adjustment 92
   Conclusion 96
List of Figures

Figure 2.1 Major sources of Commonwealth revenue 1909/10–1928/29 33
Figure 2.2 Major Sources of Commonwealth expenditure 1909/10–1928–29 33
Figure 2.3 Australian Government Taxation 1929-30 and 1938-39 37
Figure 2.4 Key variations in Commonwealth finance across World War Two 38
Figure 2.5 Australian economic performance relative to OECD average, 1970 41
Figure 2.6 Australia's trade profile (1965) relative to other OECD countries 42
Figure 2.7 Total national revenue as a % of GDP, 1968/69-1970/71 45
Figure 2.8 The Structure of Australia's tax base relative to select developed countries (1970) 46
Figure 2.9 Post-war growth in taxation burden on average earnings 48
Figure 2.10 Sources of State and Local Government Revenue 1967-68 49
Figure 3.1 The incidence of total Australian taxes raised, 1966-67 54
Figure 3.2 Wages and profit shares as a percentage of GDP, 1959-94 55
Figure 5.1 The impact of the One Nation package on ALP support 110
Figure 6.1 Public support for a GST 1996–1999 128
Figure 6.2 Benefits of ANTS income tax cuts across income groups 140
Figure 6.3 Comparison of the distributional impact of the Coalition and ALP's 1998 tax reform proposals 142
Figure 7.1 Electoral support for the major political parties October 1998 – July 2001 154

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Sources of public revenue: Victoria and New South Wales 1897/98 29
Table 5.1 Reductions in income tax rates proposed in Fightback! 105
Table 7.1 Comparative marginal income tax rates 156
Australia's first wave of reform began with the deregulation of the financial sector from the 1970s and included the floating of the exchange rate. In the face of rising capital inflows and the growth of non-bank lending, authorities battled to manage a fixed exchange rate, a controlled capital account and domestic monetary settings. The initial response was to unwind some banking controls and partially free up the exchange rate by introducing a crawling peg. But following a government-commissioned independent review of the sector at the end of the decade, a decisive shift occurred in 1983 with a government-commissioned independent review of the sector at the end of the decade, a decisive shift occurred in 1983 with The Australian Council of Social Service said tax reform must not be reduced to a narrow argument over increasing taxes on consumption such as the GST. The group's chief executive, Cassandra Goldie, argued income taxes were the fairest taxes and should be made more efficient. People understand we have a public budget problem: they want solutions that don't impose the greatest burden on the least well-off, she said. It is too easy for people with high incomes to avoid paying their fair share of tax through devices such as negative gearing and private trusts, for some international companies The thirty year problem: The politics of Australian tax reform. RG Eccleston. The Australian Tax Reserach Foundation, 2004. 38. 2004. Pathologies in international policy transfer: The case of the OECD tax transparency initiative. R Eccleston, R Woodward. Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice 16 (3), 216-229, 2014. 37. 2014. Foreign accounts tax compliance act and American leadership in the campaign against international tax evasion: revolution or false dawn? R Eccleston, F Gray. Global policy 5 (3), 321-333, 2014. Tax experts and economists agree that tax reform is the best way forward, and political leaders and policymakers are already canvassing options, but opinions differ on exactly what those changes should be. Aside from Dr Richardson, ABC News spoke with three other leading tax experts, including the author of Australia's most recent comprehensive Commonwealth tax review, Ken Henry, to assess the leading candidates for change. Henry tax review gathers dust. A decade after his comprehensive tax review was handed to the Rudd government, Dr Ken Henry laments the lack of action and warns it is a Australia has undergone sweeping structural reforms over the past two decades that have helped transform its economic performance. To most economists, especially in international economic agencies, the reforms themselves would no doubt appear unexceptionable. In the broad, they typically apply conventional prescriptions for improving growth by removing policy-related distortions and impediments to a well-functioning market economy. However, given the magnitude of the reform requirements in Australia, and the entrenched political obstacles to reform, the manner in which the reforms were introduced